

Final Findings of US PHRF Appeal Hearing Committee regarding
the Yacht:
Lizzie Borden (Lizzie B)

An appeal of the rating adjustment to the yacht Lizzie B, a Mariah 27 (aka G&S 27), by the PHRF of Southern California Committee (SoCal PHRF) was heard on September 22, 2008.

HEARING GROUP:

The hearing was conducted by telephone conference call with the following representatives present:

Arthur Engel representing the owner Dick Hampikian; Appellant Cole Price; Representative, SoCal PHRF Committee

Jim Tichenor; Hearing Chair Appeals Committee

Bruce Bingman: Appeals Committee

Drew Freides: Appeals Committee

Paul Ansfield: Moderator and Chair, US SAILING PHRF National Appeals Committee

DISCUSSION:

Testimony and rebuttal was given by both the appellant and the SoCal PHRF Committee representative followed by questioning from each member of the Appeals Committee.

The entire discussion centered on whether SoCal PHRF had properly adjusted the rating for Lizzie B when it changed the area buoy rating from 132 to 123 in 2007. Lizzie B competes in the Wednesday night series with approximately 95 boats and sailed in over 19 races in 2007. The boat does not compete in any other events in their area.

The Appeals Committee has determined the following:

1. FACTS:

- a. Lizzie B appealed their rating in 2005 and all ratings were 132 for the period up to October 2007.
- b. SoCal adjusted the area buoy rating for Lizzie B to 123 in April of 2008.
- c. Lizzie B file an appeal to SoCal in April 2008.
- d. The SoCal appeals board reviewed the buoy rating and made no changes, leaving it at 123. Lizzie B filed an appeal to USPHRF in June of 2008.
- e. Lizzie B races in the Wednesday night series of races and does not compete in the other longer distance weekend events.
- f. Lizzie B sails in winds that typically diminish towards the end of the approximate 6 mile course.

- g. Many of the other boats in their class do not sail all of the races with the same crew. Lizzie B's rig is neither a standard nor a tall rig therefore the ratings shown in the USPHRF Handbook are not valid for this boat.
- i. The USPHRF min-average-max ratings are not valid for this boat because of the non standard rig.
- j. Lizzie B's crew is made up of the same basic group of sailors that have raced together for many years.

2. CONSIDERATIONS:

- a. Although there are a number of G&S 27's in the US SAILING data base, all are different with three rig sizes and a mixture of inboard and outboard models, however they do fall into two general groupings with Lizzie B's rig and general configuration falling between the tall rig G&S 27's typically rating in the 120 range and the short rig G&S 27's in the 135 range. This would indicate a rating in the 126 to 132 range would be appropriate.
- b. The current assigned 123 rating was based on the observed performance in 2007 and Lizzie B did win the series in 2008 using this rating; however the closest competitor evidently did not sail several races which potentially affected this outcome.
- c. Comparisons to other boats is difficult, but the J-80 ODR is present in every area where a G&S 27 is currently rated including both coasts and the Great Lakes. Outside of SoCal, the J-80 ODR rates faster with only one area showing a G&S 27 tall rig faster than a J-80 (by 3 spm). SoCal is the only area where a J-80 rates slower than a G&S 27 (by 3 spm to Lizzie B with a mid-level rig).

3. FINDINGS:

- a. The buoy area rating and the general rating for Lizzie B should be assigned at 129. This rating should remain the same for a period of 2 years beginning from October 1, 2008.